PILGRIMAGE AND INCENSE:
THE CASE OF CHORTEN NYIMA (MCHOD RTEN NYI MA)
ON THE TIBETO-SIKKIMESE BORDER

KATIA BUFFETRILLE

EPHE Paris

"La société n'interdit que ce qu'elle suscite"2

Among the many benefits said to accrue from pilgrimage to a sacred site is the purification of misdeeds, defilements and sins. Pilgrimage may also allow a person to regain his or her former standing in society after having committed a misdeed or indiscretion that disrupted the community. The case of mChod rten nyo ma is a particularly striking one of the power of such a pilgrimage.

1. MCHOD RTEN NYIMA

I first heard of a sacred place called mChod rten nyo ma in 1989. I had asked an old woman, a native of the village of Chiplung,2 in gTsang, what, in her view, were the most important pilgrimages. The first one she mentioned was that to mChod rten nyo ma, adding that it was particularly efficacious in three cases:

- When "somebody sleeps with a relative," spon kla nying po byed pa (i.e., in cases of incest);
- Following parricide or matricide;

---

1 This article was first published in Italian in "Tibetan Mountain Deities: Their Cuts and Representations," Proceedings of the 7th Seminar of the International Association for Tibetan Studies, Graz, 18-24 June 1998. Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften. Wien 1998: 19-42. I am grateful to A.M. Blondau, R. Humayun, and D. Lopez for their comments, suggestions and corrections. Last but not least, I want to thank P. Pierce of the Nepal Research Centre (Kathmandu) who assisted me with the English translation.
3 Tibetan spelling not restored.
• If one has a close relationship with a person of low status (rigs ngan).

She immediately made it clear that, although she had made this pilgrimage herself, she did not do so for any of these three reasons, and that pilgrims came in great numbers not only from Central Tibet but also from Khams.

The sacred place included, she said, a spring that Padmasambhava created with his stick; a mountain in the form of the shoulders of a lama wearing a cape; a sacred lake which gave rise to visions (usually that of a monastery which appeared in the lake to those who were successfully purified). She added that for the unsuccessful this same image was still perceptible, but upside down. She also mentioned the presence of a stūpa and a monastery.

I eventually discovered that this sacred place was very well known to many Tibetans. I had only to mention mChod rten nyi ma in the presence of people from gTsang or dBu, or to many Sherpas as well, and as soon, the notion of incest was invoked. Parricide and matricide were often mentioned as well. People would sometimes recite the reasons to go to mChod rten nyi ma like a litany, as had my first informant. Each informant also denied having gone there for one of these purposes; all considered this sacred place to be particularly potent and said that they had gone there for this reason alone. The A mdo ba and the Khams pa whom I questioned, however seemed not to even know its name, and there were many among them for whom the idea of a pilgrimage to purify the defilement of incest seemed almost unimaginable; if some would admit that this transgression might exist in Central Tibet, they denied completely the practice in the eastern provinces.

The literature contains occasional reference to this place, particularly the pass bearing the same name. The latter is located on the frontier between Sikkim and Tibet, and has been negotiated by various explorers including Captair J. Noel (see Lhalungpa 1983: 151); pandits such as Rinzin Namgyal⁴ (see Das 1902: 1970); climbers (see Freshfield 1903: 1979); and political officers (see White 1909: 1984: 92).

⁴ Rinchen Namgyal traveled around the Gangs chen mde'pdul lnga (the Kāñchenjunga of the alpine) in 1885. Letter from H.E. Richardson: 11-1-1991.
1. mChod rten ngyi ma in Western literature

mChod rten ngyi ma, also called rDo rje ngyi ma, is a sacred place to the south of Sa skya, on the border with Sikkim but still in Tibetan territory (see map). Located in a wide valley, it is dominated by high cliffs and snow-covered peaks. The mChod rten ngyi ma Range consists of fourteen such peaks, with an average height of 6,700 meters; the highest, called mChod rten ngyi ma, rises to 6,927 meters (Chuar 1994: 806). D. Freshfield went there at the beginning of the 20th century, and he describes the place as having a lake (from which a river issues), a stupa, some monastic cells and carved stone walls. He adds that every year pilgrims from all parts of Tibet, as well as from Mongolia and China, make their way there. A. David-Neel arrived in 1912. She was struck by the beauty of the landscape and the aridity caused by the high altitude. At that time the monastery lay in ruins, she writes, though this does not appear clearly in her photographs (1979: 28). She speaks of one hundred and eight springs, some cold, others hot, the majority of which can be seen only by “those who have a particularly pure mind” (1929) [1977: 73-77] and notes that she rode on horseback for four days from mChod rten ngyi ma before the golden roofs of the monastery of bkra shis brgyud po, at Shigu, came into view (quoted by Miller 1984: 156). Lama Anagarika Gavinda (1969) [1976: 24] describes “a large and open place with, here and there, snow-covered peaks which pierce the sky, which is of the dark blue typical of these high altitudes.” V. Chan (1994: 808) locates the site within a one-day walk from Sikkim; a newly built road leads there from the bridge at Sa skya; the pilgrims from Central Tibet now come by truck, their numbers often reaching one hundred a day during the season (which is not specified). In the past, this monastery accommodated a constancy of monks and nuns. When A. David-Neel passed through, there were four nuns in residence. Y. Chas (1994: 806) places the number at “12 nuns and some monks.” According to an informant from rTsor skor, a village located to the south of the sacred mountain of rTa'bl ni, on the road leading from Nepal to Lhasa, the religious community resides there only in summer, conditions being too harsh during the winter because of the high altitude. V. Chan indicates (1994: 801-10) a line of stūpas at the entrance of the monastic complex, the presence of three other

5 My translation.
6 My translation.
*stūpas* and a monastery, the most important chapel of which, on the western side, is dedicated to Hayagrīva.

2. Oral testimonies

All the informants agree on the presence of a lake, a spring, a mountain, a monastery and a *stūpa*, but the number of the latter varies from person to person: sometimes they speak of one, other times three, occasionally four (one big and three small), and once thirteen (which may correspond to the set 5, 7, 8, Chan mentions). According to information A.M. Blondeau obtained in 1991,7 one finds there the Guru med rten, the history of which is as follows: when Padmasambhava came to this place, there were three demons (*bhiud*) one of which was called Srin pc. In order to defeat them, the Indian saint drove his stick into the earth. One black *stūpa* was built there, and the demon is confined beneath it. This *stūpa* stands alone and is located in a deserted place (*sa chen stong pa*).

Two of my Sherpa informants localized the source of the spring as being under a *stūpa* (they did not specify which one). The lake that gives rise to visions is commonly noted not only for its purifying role but also for its function as a mirror: young single women can see in it the village into which they will marry (informant from Walungchu Gola, eastern Nepal). Also, not only one lake may be mentioned but two, one white (*O ma mtsko*) and one black (*Nag po mtsko*).8

There is general unanimity on the motives that lead people to go on pilgrimage to mChod rten *nyi ma*, the most strikig being purification from incest.

During an interview I conducted in 1989, in Nepal, with an inhabitant of the village of bKong rtsa, located to the north of rTshö vi (southern Tibet), I learned that there was a case of incest among his kin. The daughter of one of his "aunts" had a relationship with the son of a relative (he could not specify the degree of kinship). The couple considered leaving but eventually decided to stay. Once the facts were known, they were beaten by the villagers and sent to mChod rten *nyi ma*. There they were compelled to bathe in the lake and then in the

---

7 Her informant came from gTsang and was about forty years old.
8 The theme of a malevolent black lake inhabited by a demon and located close to a beneficial lake is common. For other examples of malevolent counterparts, see K. Buffetrille (1993: 106).
spring. After the bath, they went to the monastery to obtain a letter affixed with a seal certifying their compliance with the rite. (To have gone back to bKong rtsa without this paper would have been equivalent, in the eyes of the community, to not having gone on the pilgrimage, and would have led the villagers to send them back to mChod rten nge ma once more.) When they returned, they re-entered their respective families and regained their former position in the community. One child was born from this union but died almost immediately, which obviated the determination of its states.

In this story, it is stated clearly that the couple was sent to mChod rten nge ma but the villagers from Wurlungchu Gola provided another scenario: if, in the guilty couple, the man belongs to a superior social class, his mother accompanies him, but if it is the woman who enjoys a superior status, her father accompanies her. Thus far, I have no other testimony corroborating this assertion. Other versions were not as detailed but did contain another contradiction: it is not always the couple who is sent to mChod rten nge ma but sometimes only the man.

One Sherpa informant who had lived in Lhasa for a long time maintained that the offenders were sent to mChod rten nge ma on a bullock and were accompanied by a man on a horse. On the way back, the pair had to walk. This information, although isolated, seems important. The expulsion of criminals by means of a brown bullock is, as we will see, a punishment already noted in the literature (Karmay 1591: 362).

My informants never mentioned any stigma being attached to incestuous persons who returned to their village with the certificate.

3. The stories

The information provided by Prince Peter of Greece (1963: 455) corroborates in part the preceding. In 1952, he met the abbot of the monastery of mChod rten snying (7i ma in Kalimpong, Bengal), and inquired into his past:

It appeared that he was the abbot of the monastery at Chöten Nyingma, and that the latter was a very special cxe in Tibet, because the waters of the lake had the property of being able to wash away the sin of incest. Anyone having had sexual relations with somebody within the prohibited degree of consanguinity could be purified of the pollution by making a pilgrimage to Chöten Nyingma Tso (lake) where, after having
plunged in its waters, he or she would make an offering to the monastery. The abbot whom I met would, in exchange, deliver a certificate that the person was now absolved of all sin, and the petitioner could go home satisfied and appeared. It appeared that the principal source of revenue of this particular monastery came from this trade in certificates, and that this was the reason for the prosperous appearance of the incarnation whom I just met.

One of the nuns at the monastery when A. David-Neel visited (1929) 1977:92 asserted that the lama of the place resided in Grang rlung, a one-day walk away, and was a very rich Tantrist, able to perform many wonders such as making rain or hail fall or stop. It is well-known in the Tibetan world that devotees make donations to the monastic community in proportion to their wealth or to their requests, which is a sufficient background to explain putative cases of influence among the priesthood.

II. QUESTIONS RAISED BY VCHO-D RTEN NYIMA

1. Incest in the Tibetan world

Incest is a subject people only discuss reluctantly. People will often say that they have never heard of actual cases but recognize that the practice may occur. Most of my Sherpa informants maintain, however, that it does not exist in their homeland. Here, I will survey references to Tibetan incest in Western literature, references that are often at odds with the information I obtained from numerous interviews with Tibetan refugees in Nepal.

One may note that one term exists for incest in Tibetan (nasl), unlike in Turko-Mongolian languages. The term nasl\(^9\) is unknown to the

---

9 According to a Tibetan refugee in Paris who visited mChod rten nyi ma, the name Grang rlung ("Cold Wind") is justified by the icy wind that often blows there.


11 A Dunhuang manuscript that R.A. Stein studied (1971: 528 passim), which he called "Le conte des trois sœurs," speaks of a demon who kills his father, eats him, puts on his clothes and returns home to sleep with his mother (brnaid). Stein (ibid.: 529, n. 112) refers to "rental/brnaid: sleep" or brnaid: defilement and nasl: incest."
majority of contemporary Tibetans, and S. G. Karmay suspects that it is a word encountered only in ritual texts, and which has been retained there to the present.

The Penal Code of Byang chub rgyal mtshan (1302-1373), the Zhad legya bbras (1899-1903: 74), includes cases of adultery and (to a rather limited range) of incest under the single expression byi bbas pa (?), defined as: “to have [sexual] relations with the wife of someone else or one’s [own] mother or sister.”12 The punishment consists in exiling the offenders after one of their limbs has been amputated.13 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.14 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.15 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.16 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.17 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.18 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.19 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.20 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.21 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.22 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.23 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.24 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.25 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.26 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.27 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.28 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.29 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.30 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.31 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.32 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.33 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.34 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.35 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.36 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.37 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.38 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.39 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.40 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.41 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.42 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.43 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.44 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.45 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.46 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.47 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.48 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.49 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.50 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.51 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.52 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.53 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.54 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.55 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.56 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.57 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.58 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.59 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.60 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.61 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.62 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.63 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.64 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.65 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.66 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.67 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.68 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.69 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.70 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.71 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.72 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.73 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.74 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.75 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.76 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.77 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.78 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.79 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.80 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.81 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.82 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.83 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.84 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.85 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.86 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.87 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.88 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.89 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.90 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.91 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.92 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.93 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.94 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.95 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.96 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.97 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.98 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.99 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.100 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.101 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.102 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.103 These two misdeeds are thus dealt with identically on a penal level.
maerical side, according to the region (Guigo 1986: 109). It is likely that marriage with a cross-cousin was widely practiced in the past. Rather Desideri ([1937] 1995: 192), a Jesuit who lived in Tibet from 1715 to 1721 and who had a keen eye for detail, asserts that intimate relations with somebody of the same “bone” (ivre) is regarded as incest, regardless of the degree of proximity; on the other hand, while it is prohibited to have such relations on the site of “flesh” with a person of first degree kinship (an uncle cannot marry his niece), wedding a maternal cousin (the matrilateral cross-cousin) is allowed and is not rare. Marriage with a matrilateral cross-cousin is even preferred in some Tibetan-speaking communities, including Dolpo (Jest 1975: 252); the Nyin ha community of western Nepal, where marriage occurs with cousins on both sides of the family (Levine 1988: 59); and Baragao, where marriage with a patrilateral cross-cousin is accepted and marriage with a matrilateral cross-cousin is preferred (Schuler 1983: 185; Ramble 1984: 138).

Is it possible to know one’s ancestors back to seven generations? There is no clear consensus. D. Guigo maintains that “Tibetans do not always have a very precise idea about the definition of exogamic kinship. At the first degree, it is obvious that all unions with first cousins are prohibited, but from the second degree the picture sometimes becomes blurred.”17

This would mean that exogamic rules belong to the realm of norms and that the gap between them and actual practice can be great. According to S.G. Karmay, most of the families of his native area (Shar khog in Amdo) possessed a kind of written “genealogy” (rgs yig), such that it was possible to trace roots back to seven generations.18 During funerals, there was a ceremony for transferring merit to all dead ancestors (men and women alike), whose names were written on a paper called a “dedication support” (hsang po rten). The name of the most recent deceased was added at his or her death.

In the mGo log vocabulary, an inceastuous relation with a close relative is compared to murder (Guigo 1986: 113), which may explain why the three major crimes that lead people to mChod rten nyi ma are patricide, matricide and incest.

17 My translation.
18 Genealogies may be oral: G. Condaminas ([1957] 1974: 106) shows that some Mong Gar of Central Vietnam are able to recite long genealogical poems that go back to the fifteenth generation.
How was incest understood in the Tibetan world? Here, too, information gleaned from the scholarly literature is contradictory.

G. Patterson (quoted by Prince Peter of Greece 1963: 455) asserted that he knew the case of a father and daughter living together openly and publicly which, he claimed, aroused some reprehension but more commonly no more than a feeling of curiosity. 22 Again, Prince Peter of Greece (1963: 455) reports that an unnamed British commercial agent told him in 1939 that the Tibetans do not attach "morbid stigmata" to such a practice, considering it only harmful to the health of the couple and detrimental to the offspring of such a union. Nevertheless, the statements Prince Peter of Greece quotes relating to incest contradict this affirmation: "Kill the issue of incestuous relations" (pha span nir del zang na bdag go), "incest between brother and sister must be confessed" (bu sring rtsa na pha 'byin?/ pi 'nyin la sksab) also "brother and sister [who sleep together commit] black incest" (migs sring na dang); "incestuous brothers and sisters must be separated" (mung spon gyes stags na); "divine incest by the teacher" (slob don gi yis ba na). In the end, most of the Western authors (for example B. Aziz 1978b: 53) and all Tibetans interviewed agree that incest is regarded as a particularly horrible crime in the Tibetan world, and the difficulty in obtaining information is a further indication of the taboo surrounding the subject.

In the Himalayan and Tibetan world, the offence weights most heavily, of course, on those who have committed it. But incest is regarded also as an anti-social act, in that it invites calamities to befall the community as a whole. 23 It is natural, therefore, that the whole group should be troubled by such an act. Incest disturbs the order of nature. All my informants said that if there was an incestuous couple in the village, storms, hail and avalanches would occur, the members of the offenders' families would die at an early age and all their undertakings would be doomed to failure. In the Limbu heartland of

22 G. Patterson is perhaps extrapolating. In Tibet it is possible for a step-father to have relations with his step-daughter.

23 This pronouncement and the following ones were provided to him by R.A. Stein in January 1955. The expression slob don gi yis ba na occurs in "a very widely reprinted confession of sins containing a list of sexual relations regarded as incestuous" or "prohibited" (my translation). This text called So ldag 'chugs 'thun is a xylograph of seventeen pages, without the author's name (R.A. Stein [1962] 1941: 129 and 1/2).
Nepal, “the village closes in on itself, being itself affected by the defilement.”22 (Sagat 1982: 167). Other supernatural sanctions may occur. The old woman from Walunggri Gola who went on a pilgrimage to mChod rten ngyi ma added that grass turned yellow under the footsteps of offenders. In the Nyin ba population of West Nepal (Levine 1984: 571), those who violate this prohibition will develop cracks in their bones, verified after their death—a punishment that fits the crime, incest being unlawful relations between two people of the same “bone.” Among the Rai, incest is actually called hadphora, “breathing the bones.”23 In Drog ri (southern Tibet), the guilty are consigned to a state of perpetual pollution (Atz 1978: 58), as are the Khumbu of eastern Nepal (Schicklgruber 1992: 733). The function of mChod rten ngyi ma is all the more striking in this light.

Traditionally, incest could be punished by death, as was the case in Dol po (Jest 1975: 259), where offenders were sewn into a yak-skin and thrown in the river, the same punishment for the murder of one’s father or mother in Sikkim (Waddell 1899: 107), and which in general was reserved for major criminals. Often the incestuous couple was expelled from the community and exiled far away,24 “beyond seven passes and seven rivers.”25 In the Tibetan community of Gyasumdo (Central Nepal), carnal relations between a celibate lama and one of his nun disciples are regarded as “the worst kind of incest” (Mumford 1989: 238). There is no consanguinity in this case, but the relation between a religious man and his close disciple is regarded as a filiation, as the terms sras ("son") and dugs sras ("spiritual son") which refer to close disciples suggest, recalling the phrase quoted by Prince Peter of Grécio, “divine incest by the teacher” (llos dpun gyi lha sgal). One can qualify this relation as “second-degree incest” in the words of F. Heitner (1979) for whom “the symbolic aspect of incest, resting as it does on the solid pillars of identity and difference, does not necessarily have any connection with real consanguinity, properly genealogical; on the contrary, it presupposes a logical, syntagmatic relationship that unites diverse orders of representation with each other.

22 My translation.
25 la bahen eeing chu byam gyes lab nas.
26 The Tibetan spelling is uncertain: it may be rGya gtsom nado.
representations of the individual and his parts, genetic representations of vertical and horizontal transferences operating between individuals by way of filiation and contagion, representations of the relationship between the sexes and of the world of kinship, as well as representations of the natural world and the social order in their intimate relationship with biological man (1979: 239). The village of Tshap (Central Nepal) experienced such a case in the recent past. The accused was the lava of the village. He had actively taken part in the propagation of Buddhist doctrine and in the abolition of the blood sacrifices practiced by the neighbouring Gurungs; the nun was the daughter of the chief of the village. The whole community was shattered. The father of the young woman confessed that his honour had been sullied: “They have zan my nose,” he exclaimed, an expression which recalls the punishment sometimes inflicted on an adulterous woman (Duncan 1986: 69; Tucci 1960: 260).

The mythology of numerous populations of Tibetan culture or of speakers of Tibetan-Burman languages contains stories relating to incest and the consequences which ensue. Among them are myths with a cosmogenic framework; these are frequent in Tibetan literature and form the mythical background of various rituals.

Myths often have a social purpose: in the Eastern Tamang community, the first human marriage was one of primordial incest between a brother and a sister of the same clan (Steinmann 1987: 188, 193-97), just as it was in the Gurung community of Gayamdo (Mumford (1989) 1990: 143) or among the Khumbu of eastern Nepal (Deininger 1991: 145, Schickgruber 1992: 724). The latter have a myth of the origin of defilement (vi rb) among human beings. This myth relates the incest between a human son and his mother, an “eshuration of Earth-Foundation-Mother” (bsi zha a ma’s sprul brj). This first incest resulted in the curse which leads all human beings to return to where they came from: to the womb of Earth-Mother.

27 “La symbolique de l’inceste qui repose sur les piliers solides de l’étymologie et du décent n’a pas nécessairement de lien avec la consanguinité reelle; proprement génétique: elle repose par contre sur rapport logique, syntagmique qui unit entre eux divers ordres de représentations; les représentations de la personne et de ses parties, les représentations génétiques, les transferts verticaux et horizontaux qui s’opèrent entre individus par voie de filiation ou de contagion, les représentations du rapport des sexes et du monde de la parenté, mais aussi les représentations du monde naturel et de l’ordre social dans leurs rapports intimes avec l’Homo biologique.” (My translation).

28 Oral information received from A.-M. Bluméen (Paris 1995).
myth further explains that since that time, birth, death and conflicts are the defilements which must be purified if one wants to belong to the social order ruled over by clan organization (Schicklgruber 1992: 723-734).

C. Lévi-Strauss (1947] 1977: 29, 35) explained that the prohibition of incest "constitutes the fundamental step on the basis of which, by means of which, and more particularly during which the passage from nature to culture is accomplished [...], and it expresses the passage from the natural fact of consanguinity to the cultural fact of marriage alliances."²⁹ These myths delineate a cycle, from a state of social disorder that comes to a head with an act of incest, to order being restored by marriage rules, the transgression of which again plunges society into chaos.

2. Fate of offspring born from an incestuous union

All my informants agree on at least one point: a child born from an incestuous union has no place in society. It is generally described as afflicted with physical defects, it will be blind according to the Shar wa of A ndo (Griego 1986: 109), or else paralysed, dumb, or facially deformed; Lepchas and Nyin has believe that such a child will be retarded and short-lived (Gorer [1938] 1984: 151, Levine 1984: 57). Some add that the birth of a child excludes all possibility of purification and leads to the permanent expulsion of the couple and the child.

3. Ordeal or simple trial

From the various interviews I conducted, it seems clear that the pilgrimage to mChod ren nyt ma has something of the nature of a trial, and perhaps even of an ordeal (in which there is a divine intervention). To be purified, one must bathe, but the water is so cold, people said, that even the bones are affected; some informants added that if one dips one's finger into the lake, circulation stops, and that if boiled tea or boiled soup is not drunk immediately, death ensues. At the village of gNas 'og, to the north of rTsib ri (southern Tibet), I was told that one

²⁹ "La prohibition de l'inceste constitue la dernière fondamentale grâce à laquelle, par laquelle, mais surtout en laquelle, s'accomplit le passage de la nature à la culture [...], et qu'elle exprime le passage du fait naturel de la consanguinité au fait culturel de l'alliance." (My translation.)
must dip one's arm in the lake: if it comes out stiff and frozen, one is condemned, and death will follow shortly; escaping unscathed is the sign that the misdeed has been purified. Information that A.M. Blondeau obtained indicated that common people guilty of incest had to bathe in the frozen water of the Black Lake and that most of them died from this. An informant of hers related that if a Sa skyas pc hierarchy takes a woman from an inferior social stratum, he breaks the lineage of the lamas (bla ma'i borgyud). To atone, he must bathe several times in the White Lake, or Milk Lake, which only lamas, regardless of their school, are allowed to enter. When the defilement is purified, the stiipa emanates light (adi). I never was able to determine whether a lama also has to obtain a paper testifying to his sojourn.

Ordeals are not unknown in the Tibetan world. One law code stipulates that in order to ascertain the guilt of a thief, two stones, one white and the other black, be placed in a tub full of boiling oil. The defendant has to dip his hand into the oil and draw out one of the two stones; if he takes out the white one, he is judged innocent; if the other, he is guilty.30 Tibetological literature provides other examples. Some centuries ago, a quarrel arose between two hamlos in northwest Nepal, one inhabited by Nyin ba people. The argument was settled, according to the traditional custom, by an ordeal which consisted of inserting a red-hot iron into the mouth of a representative of each group. The one who was unscathed was recognized as innocent (Levine 1984: 65).

There existed at least one other type of trial in the Sharwa area (A ndo), namely the ritual hunt, which in some respects, is comparable to the case of mChod rten nyi ma. The wildlife in the surrounding mountains and forests belong to the territorial god (yul bhu), master of the soil, and as such, cannot be hunted. Nevertheless, every year a great hunt of herbivores was organized; to participate in this hunt could lead to death, and the hunters who survived were the “rect” of the territorial god (Karmay-Sagvat 1998). The risk they incurred was real; the outcome, whether good or bad, was regarded as a “sanction,” which may be compared with the “sanction” of mChod rten nyi ma; we will return to this in the conclusion.

The example of mChod rten nyi ma shows that the defilement produced by incest can be “washed” away by going to this particular place, provided one survives a fearsome physical test. As far as I know, this kind of rite during a pilgrimage is very rare. Moreover, one should

30 Oral communication of S.G. Karmay, who refers to a text of laws he is unable to identify at present (Paris, May 1995).
note that the possibility of being purified by circumambulating one of the stūpas, the lake or the sacred places, while reciting mantras, performing prostrations and making offerings (usual pilgrimage practices), was never raised; the unique nature of the trial is a mark of the严肃 and specificity of the mistreatment.

If mChod rten nyi ma the only case, or are there other places of pilgrimage known for their ability to expunge the defilement reeking from such crimes? I know of the following examples:

- An inscrutable from Baragaon, in Nepal, confided to C. Ranble that a one-week walk from Mukinath there exists a place where pilgrims go in cases of incest. He said he knew a myth on that topic but refused to give more details because it was necessary that the name of the site remain unknown so that those who go there may do so anonymously. This confirms the difficulty of obtaining information on so sensitive and taboo a subject.

- The upper cave of Halasa-Maratika in south-eastern Nepal contains four “paths to hell” (smya tshogs rnam). When one enters such a narrow crevice, one is unsure whether one will be judges innocent or guilty. The notion of ordeal is present, and with it that of supernatural sanction. The Sherpa lama of the place, Maratika Lama, assigns to one of these “paths” the ability to purify the defilement generated by incest or by carnal relations between a monk and a woman. Pilgrims seem to be unaware of the specific nature of the path, or do not devote any particular attention to it; it is only the pilgrimage guide written by the lama that indicates its properties.

- The Tibetans who settled about one hundred years ago in the area of Gyasumdo, east of Manang, in Nepal, also make pilgrimages in order to be purified of serious defilements. In the 1980s, a Tibetan from a high family ran away with a woman of low birth. When he

3) These “paths to hell” are one of the constant features of pilgrimage place. They often take the form of narrow cavities hewn not in the rock or narrow paths between the rocks that the pilgrim crosses to purify themselves and to overcome fear of the intermediary state between death and rebirth (lob drup) at the time of death.

42 The translation of this guide is in K. Buffetrille (2000: 326-31, in particular p. 329).
came back, he was compelled to undertake a pilgrimage to Muktinath (western Nepal)\(^3\) and wash out his mouth with the water of the springs in order to be purified before being able to partake of food and drink with his peers (Mamford [1989] 1990: 46). One should note in this case that only the man (not the couple) was sent on the pilgrimage, and that no stigma seems to have been attached to him upon his return.

However, an essential difference exists between the two sacred sites cited above (Gyaluse and Muktinath) and mChod rten nyi ma: the great face of the latter in matters of incest. To this day mChod rten nyi ma appears to be a most uncommon, if not unique, case.

III. THE PILGRIMAGE GUIDES

The tenantry of pilgrim informants on the impulse that drove them to mChod rten nyi ma was striking. All of them said that their knowledge came from pilgrimage guides.\(^4\)

The first one bears the title "Pilgrimage Guide of rDo rje nyi ma, Secret Register" (rDo rje nyi ma gnas rig gsal ba'i lugs chog).\(^5\) Its subtitle is: "A Pilgrim's Guide to the Hidden Land in Silkkim Revealed from Its Place of Concealment by Rig 'dzin agru kyi Idem 'phral can (1337-1408)." It was published in Delhi in 1983. Written in block capitals (klu cu), it is composed of twenty-four leaves each with five lines (with the exception of the first three, which have one, two and three lines.)

The main theme is the story of the construction of the various stūpa of rDo rje nyi ma (not called mChod rten nyi ma but in actuality the same place). The father Rig 'dzin thong mchog, of Htim rje lineage, had a son called rdZin bu (shepherd) on account of his primary occupation. In fact, he was Nam mkhla'i anying po, one of the twenty-

---


34 F.K. Etchart provided me with the first text. I found a second copy, not long after, in the library of Khru' blag Rinpoché, in the monastery of Thub la monastery on the Chhumbi river, eastern Nepal. Khra' chos phags pa, A. Chanyi brought the second one to my attention. I wish to thank both of them.

35 Henceforth: Iturje l.
five disciples of Padmasambhava. Mahakaruṇa was his tutelary deity, and his faith was so deep that various miraculous signs appeared. One day, the Red Hayagrīva issued from the heart of Mahakaruṇa. The shepherd asked him to be allowed to build a stūpa to "clear away the defilements of the living beings in these degenerate times." He was granted his wish [1-7]. On the tenth day of the fourth month a yak appeared on the Gangs chen mdzod lnga (Kashchenjunga), and the shepherd followed him with his flock of yaks and sheep. He eventually arrived in Tibet and, in a vision, saw Padmasambhava and Ye shes mtho rgyal. He questioned the Indian saint about the corrupt conditions and the signs of the times. Making a spring of nectar miraculously gush from the base of the throne, Padmasambhava answered:

From the base of the throne of the Buddhhas of the three times, a hundred springs of nectar have appeared. If one bathes in them, sicknesses will disappear [and] demons, [the creators of] obstacles will be pacified. If one drinks from them, karma and defilements will be purified. In particular, [a time will come during which] one will commit the ten non-virtues36 and the five deeds of immediate retribution37. During the degenerate times there will appear a sign, which is incest between brother and sister.38 At that time the essence of the earth, having been weakened, will be swept along by the wind, and it is certain that people will go to the hell of rājās. Because people will have had [sexual] relations with [someone] from a low social stratum or because they will have carried a corpse, their intelligence will be blocked and the ducts of sperm will be dried up. [11] This will be clear as [in] a mirror of polished [copper]. Nevertheless, all misdeeds, such as the five

37 The mthams med lnga are: patricide, matricide, murdering an Arhat, maliciously causing blood to flow from a Buddha, and causing dissension in the monastic community.
38 snying du xun zha mngos zring 'dzol ba'i bshis. The Bod rgyas thig mdzod chen mo (2249) gives for 'dzol ba: nor ba'i 'bsdus ' thugs du dang 'gis ba: to make a mistake or to breach the norm (i.e. to do something beyond the acceptable), to disturb the harmony.
forgivable sins, would be purified. [...] The central mountain is the sacred mountain (genas ri), seat of the planet Rāhula. Behind it there are three lakes, one of gold, another of turquoise and a third of conch. The next descendants of the shepherd are designated by prophecies to open this place.

A short description of the sacred site follows: it mentions a lake in which one's own karma appears as everything that will happen in the next life, and a mountain with images of Buddhas and Bodhisattvas.

Ye shes mtsho rgyal then questioned the Master on the degenerate times. Before answering, Padmasambhava stuck his stick into the ground, and in that place “a nectar, medicinal water with the eight qualities,” started to flow; then he explained the beneficial qualities of this water.

Next comes the story of the construction of the three stupas, one by the shepherd (that is, Nam mkha’ snying po), the other one by Ye shes mtsho rgyal and the third built by the two of them together, according to the instructions of the Master. One day, while the sde (mi ma) rose, the shepherd saw in a vision a vajra (rdo rje) with five points appear in space, hence the name of the place, rDo je nyi ma, “[19] As for the vague (of these stupas), they are called, on account of the omens described above, the stupa of rDo je nyi ma (Vajra-sukh), and their fame echoes like the sound of the summer-drums [the thunder].”

The benefits obtained by doing prostrations and circumambulations and by making offerings to these stupas are numerous, including, among others, obtaining children in the case of women [19]. In a short description of this sacred place, rDo je nyi ma is described as “the northern door which gives access to the hidden land of Sikkim” [22-23]. The text ends with the history of this treasure-text, the pilgrimage guide, its having been written and hidden by Ye shes mtsho rgyal and then discovered by one of the descendants of the shepherd, “the second Rgyur dpei bya dang, scienc and enunciation of the word of the shepherd,” and in the end printed by an heir to the Ḫam ra lineage.

The second text, “A Short Summary of the Pilgrimage Guide of the stupa of rDo je nyi ma” (rDo je nyi ma mchod rten gnyu gnas yig nyung karpo) is, as the title indicates much less detailed than the previous one. It was narrated by the Lord of Oddokyna

[39] The mae bu lung are: raping a female Arhat, killing a Bodhisattva, killing a monk, taking property belonging to the monastic community, destroying a stupa.

[40] Henceforthward Dora: 2
(Padmasambhava) to Ye shes mtsho rgyal and recorded by her. It is attributed to the treasure-discover (ger ston) rDo rje rgyal mchodran. The version I have is written in block capitals (dbyung can) and is composed of five folios with an irregular number of lines (from four to six). The spelling mistakes are numerous, and were corrected for me by religious scholars living in Nepal.

The text begins with an encomium to Avalokiteśvara, rDo rje nying ma being the meditational place devoted to him. The site is composed of “a high snowy peak, and a river of nectar with the eight qualities flows through it” [1b]. Ye shes mtsho rgyal wants to know “the marvellous signs manifested in this place excellent above all.” In response, the Master sets forth the various qualities of rDo rje nying ma, then the specific benefits that the site confers:

[4b] If one makes prostrations and circumambulations in this place, the five sins without remission, the five deeds of immediate retribution, the five forgivable sins [and] the ten non virtues will be purified. All wishes will be spontaneously fulfilled, and one will obtain siddhi, the common as well as the supreme. In particular, [it is] an excellent [place] for a woman who wishes for a child. The fruits obtained by merely hearing the name [of these stūpas] [will lead one to be reborn] as god or as human.

The sacred place is described as containing self-arisen stūpa, a lake that produces visions to living beings who, untainted by the defilements of bad karma, possess good fortune.

---

41 Unidentified. May be another name of Rig 'dzin grol idem.
I. TWO TRADITIONS, TWO DISCOURSES?

1. The oral tradition

According to oral and written traditions, mChod rtén nyi ma was created, or rather, "opened", by Padmasambhava. It is a perfect sacred place, featuring a lake and a mountain and also a spring, three characteristics of the landscape sifermants never fail to cite; it is only as an afterthought that they add to their description what must be regarded as the main element of the site, if toponomy is any indication— the one or more stūpa. In fact, in none of the collected stories does the stūpa play a role except when the guilty lamas bathe in the Milk Lake and light is emitted from the stūpa, the sign of the purification of these religious dignitaries. According to two Sherpa informants, the only function of the stūpa seems to be to shelter the spring. Although all the
people I questioned knew the name rDo rje nyi ma, “Vajra-Sun”, they only used its other name, mChod rten nyi ma, “Stūpa-Sun,” thus recollecting the presence of the one or more stūpa, of which the stories hardly speak. A. David-Neel ([1929] 1977: 73-74) explains the name mChod rten nyi ma by reference to a stūpa “containing precious relics [which] miraculously transported itself through space, from India to this place.”42 This story of a flying stūpa was never confirmed to me.

If one follows the oral tradition, the stūpa of mChod rten nyi ma have no particular value for pilgrimage, which leads one to think that they are later constructions (both literary and physical), an interpretation put forward by Buddhists to divert attention from its original significance. The light which is said to emanate when a monk or lama purifies himself merely confirms this hypothesis. The importance of the monastery is more pronounced in the stories: it is there that offenders obtain the letter testifying to their presence and to the fact that they have been purified, and thus to the success of their undertaking. Unfortunately, I have yet to learn when the monastery was built.

The main role, however, is played by the waters, those of the lake or of the spring that Padmasambhava tapped. The stories are not always very clear on this point. The oral tradition takes no note of a benefit clearly mentioned in the two guides, which commonly leads Tibetans to go on the pilgrimage, i.e., obtaining a child. Only two informants seemed to be aware of this, the most detailed information on the subject having been collected by A.M. Biondou. If a childless couple performs a circumambulation (of the lake?/of the stūpa) and has sexual relations that evening, they will be blessed with a child, to whom they will be expected to give a name that includes the term Gu ru; for example, Gu ru'sgrol ma if it is a girl or Gu ru Tsho-rin if it is a boy, in recognition that the child was born following a wish made at mChod rten nyi ma, the sacred place of Padmasambhava.

2. The written tradition

The written tradition highlights the construction and the existence of the one or more stūpa from which the sacred place takes its name. The presence of a sacred mountain is cited in the two guides (Dorje 1: 11 and Dorje 2: 1b). The one discovered by Rig ’dzin rgya’gim Idem recalls the

42 My translation.
rise of incest as the true sign of degenerate times, as are sexual relations with someone from a low social stratum or the act of carrying a corpse. It specifies in effect that these defilements (like those resulting from the five deeds of immediate retribution, the five forgivable sins and the ten non-virtues) will be purified if one goes on a pilgrimage to rDo rje nying ma, the northern door of the hidden land of Sikkim.43

The second text contains nothing to suggest that there is any connection between this sacred place and the purification of defilement incurred from incest or sexual relations with someone from a low social stratum, unless a statement by the author in citing the benefits obtained at this site can be so interpreted: “What is there to say about the main pollution owing to the impurities?” [3a]. Is this a discrete evocation of the major pollution of incest? On the other hand patricide and matricide are among the five deeds of immediate retribution (med lag) which are explicitly purified at the site.

Incest is obviously not the main theme of these guides. There is thus a striking gap between the discourse of the laypeople and that of the texts [and therefore of the religious figures]. mChod rten nying ma demonstrates that even if the priesthood proposes a scenario, laypeople provide their own emphasis. They are not two parallel lines of discourse, they are intertwined. One of the pilgrimage guides prophesies that during degenerate times the phenomenon of incest will appear, and the oral tradition transmits the idea that the defilement of such an offence can be purified by going to mChod rten nying ma.

Unfortunately no source provides any reason why this particular place is able to cleanse such misdeeds. Both of the pilgrimage guides and the informants are silent on this point. Only the place itself may hold the clue but its location on the Tibeto-Sikkimese border makes access difficult.

V. AN ATTEMPT TO INTERPRET THE PILGRIMAGE OF MCHOD RTEN NYIMA

The pilgrimage to mChod rten nying ma appears to be a means of responding to the transgression of a forbidden act, a crime which

43 The guide points out, fol. 16r, that “the benefits [obtained] by doing prostrations and circumambulations and by making offerings at these springs (Chu nying brgya tsa), that is Mukrinath,” It would be interesting to know if the people with whom S. Mensford worked knew this text.
rebounds against the community as a whole, unleashing various calamities. It allows reintegration into the group for those offenders who survive the trial of freezing water, proof that they have been purified. The presentation of a myth may help to understand the relationship between pilgrimage, incest and trial.

1. From myth to reality

One finds the following amazing passage in the bKa' 'chens ka khod ma (1989: 305-06), “The Testimony of Srong btsan sgam po” Hidden in a Pillar”, a treasure-text discovered, according to tradition, by Atilla (982-1054).44

At the time, Bum thang monastery was being built, King Srong btsan sgam po left for Phan yul to look for craftsmen:

[305] There were there a father and a mother who did not have a clan-name and who had two daughters and two sons as beautiful as gods. Because they loved each other, [the girls] refused to leave [for somewhere else] as brides, [and the boys] did not agree to bring women [from outside]; but because they were ashamed [to do so], they did not dare to settle down as [married] couples [with each other]. They were craftsmen.

The king said to them: “You must come and become my craftsmen.”

The craftsmen answered: “[There are four conditions]: 1. not to be compelled to follow the rules of decency; 2. not to have to seek another occupation; 3. to have a hot meal before [work]; 4. to wear a cape. King, if you accept [these conditions], we will go.”

The great king accepted and, having invited them, they worked as craftsmen in, among other places, Bum thang, Ra mo che, mKhar brag, Them bu kog pa, and Mig mangs tshal. They were

---

44 I am grateful to S.G. Karmay for drawing my attention to this part of the work. It is necessary to point out that the version of the bKa' 'chens ka khod ma published in Literary texts in Ladakh, Vol. 1, Darjeeling, 1972, in 14 chapters, and the one of the Ma' 'ongs lang bstan gyur bu' s sgruan me (Man tras shes rig spen mdo, Vol. 33, Leh 1973) in 12 chapters do not include the above extract.
happy. The four, brothers and sisters, were living as couples, and their children grew in number happily. It is said that there were seven large villages called the Seven households of the Happy People.45

Ong Cong [the Chinese wife of the king] said: “These people are shamelessly increasing happily beyond bounds. [So] they received as clan name that of Happiness (ts[s]kyi[d]).”

A Ben po from Sun pa46 [called] Kakar said: “Your craftsmen having committed the impurity of incest, the king's pho lha has been struck by the impurity, and the monarch will fall sick and die. Do not let them act in this way. If they do not obey, I will perform black magic.” He made an evil spell of rice (lunga) and cast it. In no time the rice became as large as pigeons. They filled the inside and the outside of the Seven households of the Happy people; but whatever was done [the craftsmen] did not agree to leave and so it was said, their number continued increasing.

Then, the Seven households of the Happy people took fright; the sister-wives were sent away as daughters-in-law, and the brother-husbands asked spouses to come [from outside]. Thus they multiplied even more than before and filled the whole of dbu ru [Central Tibet].

Because they said: “The center (bhyil shoe) of this country is [the homeland] of the tribe of [s][Kyi[d],] the name dbu ru [s][Kyi]dbod was given to it; and because they said: “We drink from this turquoise-blue river,” the name Kyi [s][Kyi] chu stgon po was given to the river.

This story that the bkha' chams ka khod ru relates in providing the etymology of toponyms can be interpreted as a legend of the origin of a primal clan. From it one can see that incest and lack of shame existed before the organization of the clans, otherwise the attitude of the king and the craftsmen would not be understandable. The foremost accepts

46) A place in north-eastern Tibet.
the conditions set by the craftsmen, which suggests that he is not aware of the possible consequences; the others insist not only on being allowed to continue in their incestuous relationship but also feel unashamed. This text explains that the pho lha of the king, affected by the de/eminent of incest, is responsible for the potentially fatal illness of the monarch. The legend of Gri yum recalls the seriousness of deserting the pho lha, dgra lha or mgur lha of a king.47 The pho lha, god of the male lineage, belongs to the group of five gods born with men (‘go ba lha), which reside on various places on the body. The list of these gods varies,48 and authors do not even agree on the parts of the body the gods occupy.

S.G. Karmay (1995: 166) relates a legend taken from the gzhi brjads in which it is said that one day the demon Khya pha lag ring threw a thunderbolt containing the nine impurities at the head of gShen rab mi bo with the aim of killing or at least polluting him, but without success. A list of these nine impurities is given: “Homicide/fratricide (dnci), the birth of a child just after its father dies (rnying, incest (rnyal), shamelessness (bsod), imprecatory signs (tshun), bad omens (ltaus ngsan), something possessed by the mind (byas), impurity owing to the death of a husband or wife (yug), pollution of the hearth (thub mkhoin).

Another myth may help to understand better the implications and consequences of the offence of incest for Tibetans. While Bon


49 This is the longest biography of gShen rab mi bo, the founder of Bon, according to tradition. See S.G. Karmay (1975).

50 C. Ramble (1998: 130, n. 14) notes that in Baragang (southern Mustang) where people speak a form of Western Tibetan called locally the Dzardzong dialect, “sul is never used in the Dzardzong dialect, and dnci unquestionably signifies incest. The expression dnci rnyal bo means ‘to commit incest’ (‘rnyal bo: ‘to mix’), and dnci phug denotes a child born from an incestuous union. The apparent difference in meaning is perhaps resolved by the notion, common to both interpretations, of a prohibitively close degree of kindship within which an otherwise legitimate (or at least non-polluting) activity takes place. This suggestion is borne out by one of the definitions of dnci phug given in the Bod rGest tbyings ra ba, sgra dus kii shod zin du yugs ras gcig pa’i sngern phyogs snging khol phaon shan grol rgyas pa dang pho mgo bkab ba’i phug.” In popular usage in the past, impunity from reciprocal killing or sexual relations between members of the same clan or close relations.”

51 My emphasis. The translation is also mine.
declined in Tibet, King Khri Srong lde btsan, following his order that Buddhism to be practiced by his subjects, fell ill and numerous scourges beset the country (Karmay 1972: 83-84 and 1991: 365). The monarch called a soothsayer to learn the reasons for this and to determine the most effective rituals. The soothsayer explained:

"O Lord, it is because of the pollution of a child born from an incestuous union and from the magic of the demons Na'i mi zan snying dnar (Anthrhopophagous Insect, Red Heart) [...]. There are misfortunes in this country because the thirteen pure deities of this world are unhappy about the existence of this child." Everyone was worried about [...]. The ministers said to him, "O clear-sighted soothsayer, we ask you to find this child and to tell us the ritual whose execution will be beneficial." The soothsayer said: "[...] The eighteen Bonpos belonging to the various clans must perform the rite Glang nig thu'r sel.52 For this rite, it is necessary to have a brown ox loaded with objects of offering and ransom for the man and the woman with, on top of these, the incestuously produced child. The expulsion must be in the southwest direction; this will be beneficial.53

Several themes of this mythical story can be found repeated in the pilgrimage to mChod rten sgyi ma, namely that of incest, the various calamities which befall the community, and the child which is the fruit of the incestuous union and which, if it survives, has "monstrous" characteristics.54

3. Mountain-deities and insect

S.G. Karmay explains in a footnote (1991: 365, n.157) that the thirteen pure deities are all mountain-deities. When angry, they send various calamities. By the ritual and the expulsion of the child on an ox loaded

52 This is the title of a ritual the text which has yet to be found. S.G. Karmay advised against attempting to translate the title under these circumstances.

53 This part, translated by S.G. Karmay (1991: 365), is extracted from the Sri'i rgyud of Khod po Blo gros thang med (13th century), a text which deals with the expansion and decline of Bon during the royal epoch. (My translation from French to English.)

54 The theme of the ransom (evoked by the expulsion of the incestuous couple on an ox) will not be touched on in this article for lack of space.
with ransom, the defilement of incest is eliminated and the mountain-deities are sacrificed.

The concept of mountain-deities being responsible for the order of nature and for prosperity is well-known in the Tibetan tradition. Dunhuang documents point out that "the prestige of the royal person and his health, the stability of the kingdom and that of the government, the absence of sickness among men and cattle [and] the abundance of food" depend upon the appeasement of the skhu bha. "mountain-deities, ancestors and the support of the vital principle of kings" (ibid.: 309). We have already emphasized that all informants and the ethnological literature recognize that in cases of incest, calamities (such as storms and hail) are bound to occur. When hail falls, say S.G. Karmay and P. Sagar (1987, 251), it is the yen thu who is called upon because "the attitude of all the other gods over whom he exercises his empire depends upon his good-will as the master of the soil (gtsi bleg)." The yen thu (territorial-god and mountain-deity) is generally regarded as the ancestor of the population that lives around. It is not surprising that the territorial-god, ancestor of the community, reacts in a violent way to incest, patricide, matricide, and even to sexual relations with someone of low birth. In a manner of speaking, one can say that it is a "family affair." Becoming angry if he notices transgressions, he turns away, and the territory along with the population living in it no longer enjoy the protection of the god and are abandoned to all manner of malevolent forces.

VI. CONCLUSION: THE EXPIATION OF THE "YEN THU"

The nature of the rite performed at mChod ren ryi ye is difficult to determine with certainty. Let us be cautious and say that it is a trial which has characteristics of an ordeal. The judgment would be not of the guilt or innocence of the couple but on whether they are forgiven or not. Thus the transgression of the taboo on incest would not be entirely irremovable.

56 My translation.
57 It seems that this concept is unknown in Bhutan (Potteraret 1996: 29-56), and in Zanskbr (1996: 23-28).
The connection between incest and the calamities launched against the community by the yal lha leads to a possible interpretation of the purificatory rite at mChod rten ngyi ma. For the community, would it not be the territorial god (yal lha) who is expressing his displeasure? (the written and oral traditions mention the presence of a mountain). 56

This hypothesis is supported by the usual treatment reserved for the incestuous. By expelling them, the community hopes to escape from the supernatural retribution sent by the territorial-god. This expulsion must allow it to recover its lost honour. (Recall the father of the young nun in the village of Gyanzando.)

But it is here that Buddhism intervenes at mChod rten ngyi ma. The society requires certification of the trial that incestuous persons have undergone; this they will obtain in the monastery. Anyone who goes on a pilgrimage without having committed any serious misdeed does not need this certificate. Buddhism religious authority intervenes at the time the letter is delivered; it consists itself with satisfying an irrefutable fait decided by the trial. Thus Buddhism gives its seal of approval, recognizing that the pilgrimage has the capacity to purify the defilement produced by, among other things, incest. Without this certificate, the pilgrimage is null and void in the eyes of the community. It is proof that the man (the couple?) really has been to mChod rten ngyi ma, that he has submits to the trial and that he has been purified. His survival proves to the community that henceforth he will not be stricken by supernatural sanctions.

The case of mChod rten ngyi ma shows that, in some parts of Tibet and in some populations of the Himalayan regions, the death penalty or definitive expulsion is not the only way to deal with members of the group who transgress the prohibition regarding incest.

We have already singled out the story of Lama Dorje. Although all the villagers agreed that his misdeed was a very serious one, and although some of them confessed that they no longer trusted the monk, most of them wanted him to stay on and were ready to forgive him and to see him return to the monastery, this time as a named lama. An old lama intervened and gave two possible reasons to explain the "crime" of Lama Dorje: the first was that, in a past life, he had committed a very serious sin, the retribution for which was the cause of the present tragedy; the second was that his qualities were have aroused jealousy (par khod), which brought about his fall, even though he was close to

---

56 If this is the case, it would mean that the jurisdiction of the yal lha extended over people not dependent upon his territory. The question is still open.
realization. As thus there was no truly malevolent intent on his part; the community was able to reinstate harmony without resorting to expulsion (Mumford [1989] 1990: 238-239). The villagers as well as the monastic community needed such an active religious figure, which explains the lama’s intervention. Thus it is easier to understand the arrangement made to reintegrate him, as a lama married to his young disciple.

‘To put things in order in the realm is essential for preparing the return to civilization and for allowing people to find again the purity necessary for their vitality, for their prosperity’ 59 writes P. Sagant (1982: 167), and he shows how the same ideas exist not only in China but also in Southeast Asia, for example among the Mong Gau of Central Vietnam (Condominas [1957] 1974: 97-134).

Buddhist authorities could not accept that the “crime” of incest was purified by a simple physical trial based, if my hypothesis is correct, on the traditional cult to the yul lha. They therefore transformed this site into a sacred place opened by Padmasambhava. Pilgrimage guides tell us, and travellers confirm, that a stupa and a monastery were built. In this way, the monastery succeeded in controlling a socio-cultural unity with no previous link to Buddhism.

Postscript: An article published in the journal China’s Tibet (Vol. 6, No. 5, 1995: 22) sheds new light on mTshod ‘ren ngs sny ma. We learn that during the last millennium, Indians, Bhutanese, Sikkimese, Nepalese and Tibetan pilgrims came to immerse themselves in the waters of mTshod ‘ren ngs sny ma. Every day some eight hundred and twenty tons of water flow by. Numerous devotees go back home loaded with bottles filled with this water, which they offer to the members of their family and their friends. At the beginning of the 1980s, the inhabitants of the place realized the value of these sacred waters, and in 1989, they sent water samples for scientific testing. In 1990, the Tibet Autonomous Regional mTshod ‘ren ngs sny ma Holy Water Committee certified that it was, in fact, mineral water. In August 1992, the Chinese Ministry of Geology and Mineral Resources announced that this water contains rare elements beneficial to health that enhance the appetite, favour bone development, improve blood circulation, strengthen the heart and have curative effects on goitres. In 1993, the Tibet mTshod ‘ren ngs sny ma Development Company was established and a bottling factory began operation soon after. The first bottles were offered to the late Tenth Lachen Lama’s funeral stupa. The article does not mention the purification of incest.

59 My translation.
among the benefits of the waters. Is it possible that, from now on, offenders will be content to go to the Lhasa bazaar to buy bottles of mineral water in order to be purified of all defilements resulting from incest, patricide, matricide or sexual relations with someone of low birth?
TIBETAN SOURCES

1Do rje rgyal stokan, rDo rje avi ma'i mchod rin ge rgyun sgrug bshungs. Msu. 5 folio.
Byang chub rgyal stokan, gTsuns bde bzhag po's 'dzam kyi bce lha. In Bod kyi sngos rabs thams and yi' chog bzhag mo gmugs. (Gongs chos rgyi mchod N° 7). Thasa. Bod ljongs ni damgs dpe skrun khang. 1989:3; 75-76.


WESTERN SOURCES


Cults and Representations. Wien: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 122-144.


