Bulletin of Tibetology

VOL. XII  No. 1

21th February 1974.
NAMGYAL INSTITUTE OF TIBETOLOGY
GANGTOK, SIKKIM.
The Bulletin of Technology seeks to serve the readers with an interest in this field of study. The motive portraying the Stupa on the mountains suggests the dimensions of the field.
11th February 1976.
NAMGYAL INSTITUTE OF TIBETOLOGY
GANGTOK, SIKKIM.
11th FEBRUARY, 1975

PRINTED BY THE MANAGER, SIKKIM GOVERNMENT PRESS
AND PUBLISHED BY THE DIRECTOR, NAMGYAL
INSTITUTE OF TIBETOLOGY GANGTOK
CONTENTS

PAGE

1. The Temptation of the Buddha
   Dr Valentina Steche-Rosen
   6

2. The Story of Rupananda from Baniyan, Afghanistan
   Dr P. Beneviste
   10

3. Note i A translation of the Biography
   of the Mahaiddha Mahaabhuti
   Nathan Katz
   15

4. Note ii Namgyal Institute of Theology
   Dr A.M. D'Rosario
   30

Views expressed in the Bulletin of Theology are those of the
contributors and not of the Namgyal Institute of Theology.
CONTRIBUTORS IN THIS ISSUE

DR (Mrs) VALENTINA STACHE-ROSEN comes from the family of diplomats several of whom were orientalists. After studying Sanskrit, Chinese and archaeology at Goettingen University, she came to India on a postgraduate research scholarship. She specialises in Buddhist studies and has to her credit two Sanskrit texts from Central Asia. She now lives in Bangalore with her husband Dr Wilfried Stache, who heads the Max Mußer Bhavan there.

Dr P. BANERJEE, Assistant Director, National Museum, New Delhi is a well known scholar and writer.

NATHAN KATZ is a scholar working on Tibetan Buddhism at Temple University, Philadelphia, USA. Much interested in Asia, its philosophy and religion. Visited the Institute of Tibetology in 1973 and spent a useful fortnight consulting literature and making contacts with research workers.

DR A.M.D’ROZARO: The Director of the Nyingma Institute of Tibetology.
THE TEMPTATION OF THE BUDDHA

A Preliminary Comparison of some Chinese versions of an episode in the life of the Buddha

Valentina Stache-Rosen

Almost all the biographies of the Buddha relate that Mara, the evil-one, attempted in vain to disturb the Buddha, either before or after he obtained enlightenment. The accounts, however, vary in many respects. Mara, regarded as the personification of death in some of the texts 1) is the same as the god of love, Kama, in Acaganghadhara’s Buddhacarita. 2) The ways in which Mara tries to influence the Bodhisattva are manifold. He fights him with his army of demons or sends his daughters to seduce him. He offers him his kingdom and his rank, or tells him that he could prevent a horrible war by becoming king and ruling wisely and justly. He brings bad news from Kapilavastu and asks the Bodhisattva to return to his hometown and set matters right, or he tells him to enjoy life and its pleasures. 3)

The attitude of the gods also differs. They are generally neutral and offer flowers to the Bodhisattva after he has emerged victorious from the struggle. In the account given in the Pali Nidana-katha 4), Sakka (Indra) and Brahma take sides with the Bodhisattva. Sakka blowing a conch and Brahma holding a white umbrella, while a Naga praised the Bodhisattva. When, however, Mara’s army advanced, they all ran away. Sakka stood at the end of the world, Brahma returned to the Brahmaloka and the Naga lay down in his palace, covering his face with his hands. According to the T’ang Fe-pen-shuang-ching. Indra, riding on his elephant Airavata and Varuna, the god of the water, are generals in Mara’s army, and the god An-hisang (peaceful-men-Shiva), the chief of the evil spirits is the first to turn round and flee. 5) This is all the more surprising, as the same text relates that all the gods came to protect and venerate the Bodhisattva when he was born. 6) The four-headed god An-hisang for instance, was riding on a bull and took an umbrella to protect the newly born child, and Yama came to venerate him after having dismissed his prisoners from hell.

In some instances Mara’s weapons are bows and arrows, swords and spears, in others he throws hot coals, ashes, sand and mud at his adversary or hurla looks and trees at him, or he fights with a number of bad qualities such as passion, delusion and the like, which the Bodhisattva overcomes with their opposites.
In Rockhill’s *Life of the Buddha*, which is based on the Tibetan *Budha*, the account of the temptation is as follows: “Then Mara, the Evil-one, went to him and said: ‘Dharmakaya has absorbed Kapilavastu, he has seized the palace and has crushed the Buddha. Why stay you here?’ He caused apparitions of Yasodhara, of Mrgulja, and of Sopa, of Devadatta and of the Sakya who had escaped to appear before him, but the Bodhisattva remained unmoved. Then Mara reasoned with him, saying that it was impossible to find enlightenment, but all to no purpose. After that he called his three daughters, De ire, Pleasure and Delight, and they tried all their allurements, but he vain; the Bodhisattva changed them into old hags. All the Evil-one’s devices were unable to affect the Bodhisattva, and, seeing this, the deus of the pure abode and all the gods showered down flowers on the conqueror (Sujata), and sang songs of victory.”

Some of the versions of this episode from Pali and Sanskrit sources have already been compared with each other by E. Windisch in his book *Mara and Buddha*. A few Chinese texts will be analyzed below. These texts may be grouped together into five groups.

The first group comprises T. 59 *Ta-juan* (the complete *Sangihrage*), and T. 100 *Pe-ji Ta-juan*, on the complete *Sangihrage*. The temptation of the Buddha of these two texts may be compared with the Pali *Sampaya Nibyap* version, with which they agree in *anha* (sense) with only a few discrepancies in *upana* (narrating). As will be seen below, parts of a version from the Pali *Sampaya*, the *Plahaminiya*, are incorporated in these texts.

The second group consists of T. 1457 *Ku-pan-sou-tch‘an* *Cibyarpur-p‘i-lou-yeh*; the *Vinaya* of the Malayasi-candhas and T. 151 *Fe-hou-chang-hao-mo-ha-eh-ting*, *Samadhatamahaprajaputra*. The latter text begins with the appearance of the world at the commencement of a kalpa and ends with the Buddha’s visit to Kapilavastu. This text agrees on the whole with the account given in Rockhill’s *Life of the Buddha*. Apart from the fact that in T. 151 the three women who attempt to seduce the Bodhisattva are created by Mara, whereas they are his daughters in T. 1451, and that the latter text is more detailed at the end, the two texts agree.

Two Chinese texts make up the third group. T. 184 *Houchang-pan-ch‘i-eh-tch‘ing* and T. 185 *Fe-hou-ch‘ou* *Fe-pan-ch‘i-eh-tch‘ing*, two biographies of the Buddha translated in 197 A.D. and between 232 and 280 respectively. T. 184 is said to have been brought from Kapilavastu by the monk *Kophiu*. The more elaborate versions of the episode in question have been grouped together in group four and five. Group four comprises
In Group five we find the longest and most detailed accounts of the temptation. The texts belonging to this group are the Pāpillānavatā, T. 1190 [p.758-c1-c8] and Pāpillānavatāvagga, T. 1191 [p.759-a1-b6]. There may have some features in common and diverge on others.

According to E. Winckler, who compared several Pāpillānavatā texts, the Pāpillānavatā of the Pāpillānavatāavagga, which are found in Sanskrit in the Mahāvastu, in Chapter XVIII, belong to the earlier stage of the legend. This text tells us that Mara visited the Buddha with his army of demons to test the Buddha while he was doing penance on the banks of the river Nīlakaṇṭha, short before obtaining enlightenment. Mara said to him that he would destroy the Dharma if he failed to bestow him the holy relics. Mara is said to have been extremely weak and said it would be better to do good works and perform ascetism. The Buddha repeated that his mind gets some repose when the flesh is moving away. He referred to Mara's tenfold army: 1) the people, 2) the earth, 3) the fire, 4) the wind, 5) the sun and the moon, 6) the sea, 7) the mountains, 8) the oceans, 9) the rain and lightning, 10) the fire of burning hell.

A more elaborate version of this episode is found in the Mahāvastu of the Sayyadānavagga, T. 1092, and T. 1109 agrees with the Pāpillānavatā. According to these three texts, Mara approached the Buddha shortly after he had obtained enlightenment and asked him why he was alone, not seeking the company of men. The Buddha answered that he is free from attachment and has found peace. Mara then asked the Buddha not to teach his doctrine to others, but the Buddha refused to do so. In the Pāpillānavatā, a rather long song follows, which seems out of place. Just like a cask, whose heads have been cut by boys and girls, is unable to stand back to the pond it is broken in, so Mara is unable to attack the Buddha, as he has broken all castings. This episode is not found in the Chinese Sayyadānavagga, T. 1092 and T. 1109. The episode ends with a verse already found in the Pāpillānavatāavagga: "The crow cannot stand the rock that looks like (a lump of) shit. Do we have..."
find something soft, Is it something sweet? Having obtained nothing sweet there, the crow went away from that spot. Just like the crow approaching the rock, being disgusted, we shall go away from Gotama." 13) The Chinese verses say: "A white stone looked like hard fat. A bird who did not realise this wanted to eat this fat. He did not get anything to eat and hurt its beak. As he returned without getting anything to eat, thus do I return without having obtained my aim."

Is all the three texts it is said that Mara’s three daughters approached their father and offered to seduce the Buddha. Mara doubted whether this would be possible. The three daughters Rati, Arati and Tanha went to the Buddha, but he paid no attention to them. Thereupon they each took the form of a hundred women of different ages, but to no avail. Each of the three daughters in turn approached the Buddha. Tanha asked him why he stayed alone and did not make friends with people in the village. The Buddha answered that he had found peace after the vanquishing Mara’s hosts. Arati then enquired how the Buddha made it possible to cross not only five streams, but also the saha, thus reaching the other shore of desire.16) The Buddha’s answer was that his body as well as his mind were at peace. Finally Ragi stated that many people would be released by the Tathagata’s doctrine, and the Buddha confirmed this.

The three daughters then joined their father who told them that it was foolish to attempt to split a rock with sticks of flowers, to dig up a mountain with the fingernails or to eat iron. The Chinese verses add that it was as if they had wanted to catch the wind in a net or push down the moon or empty the ocean with their hands or blow down the Himalayas.

Group II is made up of T 1451: the Vinga of the Mahasangha-ne (in and T 191). These two texts tell us that the Bodhisattva was seated under the Bodhitree. Mara had two banners, one which moved when a happy event was to take place, and the other when some misfortune was at hand. The latter flag moving violently, Mara took the shape of a messenger and approached the Bodhisattva with news from Kapilavastu, saying that Devadatta had entered his palace, violated the women and killed the Sakyas.17) The Bodhisattva was affected by these tidings, and three evil thoughts of desire, ill-will and violence arose in him. He realised that these thoughts were due to Mara and he caused thoughts of renunciation, good will and non-violence to arise in him. These two versions are the only ones discussed here in which Mara’s attempts to sway the Bodhisattva from his path have any effect, albeit a temporary one.

Mara then enquired why the Bodhisattva was sitting under the Bodhitree. The Bodhisattva answered that he wanted to obtain enlighten-
ment. He told Mara that he had sacrificed his possessions, life and limbs through countless kalpas, whereas he, Mara, had obtained his rank because of some good deeds done by him, but that nobody would testify to the Bodhisattva's countless sacrifices. The Bodhisattva then touched the earth, and the spirit of the earth appeared as witness for the Bodhisattva.

T 1461 continues by referring to Mara's three daughters, whereas according to T 197 Mara created three beautiful, bashful young women. Their three women, Mara's daughters and his creation, attempted to disturb the Bodhisattva and were turned into old women. Mara then attacked the Bodhisattva with his 36 divisions of troops of demons and wild animals. The Bodhisattva entered into the meditation of compassion. The account of T 191 is somewhat shorter than that of T 1450. According to the former text, a god of the pure abode created an umbrella and protected the Bodhisattva from all the missiles hurled at him and turned them into all kinds of flowers. The Bodhisattva then performed miracles, sitting, standing and walking in the air and issuing water and fire from his body. T 1450 tells us that Mara's weapons were turned into flowers. The earth Mara raised onto his opponents was turned into fragrant substances. A god of the pure abode then created a canopy of flowers and the venomous insects Mara sent forth could not reach the Bodhisattva. Mara then thought of turning the leaves of the Bodhitree into instruments and causing the wind to blow and produce a horrible sound. The Bodhisattva's meditation was not disturbed. The gods of the pure abodes came down to help, each one took hold of one leaf so that they could not move in the wind. As Mara's army was not yet willing to disperse, the gods united and threw Mara onto a mountain. The Bodhisattva then performed miracles. This last feature is found only in these two versions. 19

T 181 and 185, Hsiu-hung-pen-ch'i-ch'ing and Fu-ssao t'ieh-to shui-pen-ch'i-ch'ing form the third group. Both versions agree with each other literally. The Bodhisattva was sitting under the Bodhitree and a light from the spot between his eyebrows entered Mara's palace and frightened him. Mara's son Suna warned his father not to fight the Bodhisattva, whose conduct was pure, but Mara did not listen. His daughters offered to seduce the Bodhisattva. Together with 100 attendants they went to the Bodhitree, playing the lute and singing and offered their services to the Bodhisattva. He told them: You are like beautifully painted vases full of filth. You do not pay heed to the fact that everything is impermanent and that you will be reborn in the three evil existences. Since innumerable ages I was free from desire and regarded women either as mothers or as elder or younger sisters. Return to your palace and do not again disturb people. 20 With
these words be turned them into old women, Mara grew furious and attacked the Buddha with the heat of demona... not able to go near him. The Bodhisattva then spoke some verses in which he said that he had served the Buddha, of such parts that he himself would become the Buddha Sakymuni. Mara's boast will be nullified and his son will be destroyed.

The three texts of group IV are the Bodhisattva T 189 Kunaḥsa
dharmaprajñāpāramitā and T 189 Jñāna-abhidheka. The latter text is a Bodhisattva biography in verse, the Kukubhusanakha, T 264a, a catalogue of Buddhist scriptures written in 153 B.C., was of this work on p. 89: "Some say this work has been composed by Anāgārika." This remark is also found in T 264a. The author's name is given as Çakka 30, whereas Nāgoja says the author of this work is Anattaloka. 21 This must be the case, as it is highly improbable that Ānāgārika should have written two Bodhisattva legends. P. 90-91, 34, the Çakka and T 189 have, however, many verses in common.

In T 189 two sisters of Mara appear, Meghad and Kāt, who are also mentioned in Buddhacottire XIII, 49: meghadāśāna svapālaśāna
kānapa padaśāna kitha cāttāra
kātapā bu tataścetan na samā
calantoṇa bodhāsāvagamā

The translation of this verse by F.S. Johnson is as follows: "But a woman, black as a cloud, with a shank in her hands, wandered about there unrestrained and did not remain still, with the intention of deceiving the great one's heart, and rendering the intelligence of a man of constant mind wandering unceasingly among the various sacred traditions." In a footnote Johnson refers to the Chinese text, in which Meghadā is taken as a proper name. As Meghadā is also, two women must be meant. In T 191 Mara rescues a woman black as a cloud, who wandered about aimlessly. 21

T 191 has a feature not found in any of the other texts—Indra, Varah, Śiva and other gods fight in Mara's army. The Bodhisattva's and Mara's weapons are good and bad qualities respectively. The Bodhisattva on the other hand is the only text which mentions three sons of Mara, Vihārana, Prabha and Dāsija. It also states very clearly that Mara is the same as the god of love, Kama:

...panta nāndana padaśāna kēla śṛṣṭaśāna pravaśaśāna kalpaśānaśānaśānaśānaśānaśānaśānaśānaśānaśānaśāna

Him, whom in the world they call the god of love, him of the bright weapon and also the flower arrowed, the same one the mother
activities of the passions and the decay of liberation they经历．”

2) This character of Mara’s is also implied in T. 191, where the five flamer errors of Mara are mentioned.

According to the Buddhavatthu and T. 191, the Bodhisattva was meditating under the Bodhi tree. Mara was depressed, and three sons in Jambudvīpa, one only called him to ask about their father why he was so. Mara told them the reason. Shāriapiṇī advised his father not to fight the Bodhisattva. In both texts, Mara remained the Bodhisattva rather belonged to the kāmarūpa stage and it was not fitting that he should become a mendicant. As the Bodhisattva put no faith to these words, Mara discharged an arrow, but none to his continuation this arrow had no effect. In the Buddhavatthu, Mara’s three daughters are only briefly mentioned, whereas T. 191 says they told to the Bodhisattva and were turned into old women. Mara burned his palace and his rank to the Bodhisattva. The Bodhisattva was not interested in this offer and called the earth as witness for his merits. The spirit of the earth testified for the Bodhisattva, offered flowers and disappeared. Both texts have a detailed description of the demons fighting in Mara’s army and their attack on the Bodhisattva. Both mention gods and men, nagas and spirits were angry with Mara. T. 191 says blood came from their pores. The gods of the pure abodes, according to T. 191 assisted the Bodhisattva, whereas the Buddhavatthu says, ”The gods of the pure abodes developed compassion in their minds, but were attached by anger because they were from from all positions.”

Thequipāqui concludes alike in both texts, an invisible spirit in the sky admonished Mara to cease, and Mara finally turned away vanquished.

The summary of T. 191 is as follows: When the Bodhisattva meditated under the Bodhi tree, the earth shook and Mara asked his minister what the meaning of the earthquake was. The minister informed him that the devotion of king Indrā in Jambudvīpa was done to obtain enlightenment. Mara’s daughters asked their father why he was depressed, and he told them the reason and asked them to hinder the spirit. They attempted to relieve the Bodhisattva and were turned into old women. Mara then called his army and mounted a splendid chariot. He went to the Bodhisattva and asked him to enjoy life and rule as a king. The Bodhisattva remained calm, even when an arrow was shot at him. Mara then decided to fight. He then carried a thunderbolt and had a thousand eyes on his body that toasted his enemies. Akoppa, Shāriapiṇī followed by silver chariots drawn by white horses and white nagas. The god of the waters, Varuna, rose a golden chariots driven by a thousand noble horses. Vaiśramana led a host of nagas, gods and demons on various weapons. Lions, peacocks, tigers, monkeys, elephants and horses surrounded. Some rode on nagas and spit fire, others had animal heads and horned shapes. They all were armed with various weapons and making horrible noises.
they attacked the Bodhisattva, who remained calm and caused flowers to fall. Mara then created a woman like a black cloud to confuse the Bodhisattva. A god asked Mara to desist, whereas Mara grew more furious and hurled the fire of desire against the Bodhisattva, who created rain clouds to put out the fire. The god An-hsiang, the greatest of the spirits, (Shin), withdrew. Mara brought earth anger and hazed and the whole world was full of venomous snakes. By meditating on compassion, the snakes were destroyed by the Bodhisattva. Mara brought forth delusion, but the Bodhisattva withdrew. Mara shot the arrow of distraction and created a nag. The Bodhisattva shot the arrow of compassion and created a gurda, which destroyed the naga. Mara shot with the weapon “pride” and created an elephant. The Bodhisattva shot with the ten powers 42) and created a lion which chased the elephant. Mara shot with the weapon “lies” and created wind. The Bodhisattva shot with truth and created a mountain. Mara shot with avance and created fog. The Bodhisattva shot with liberality and created a raincloud so that the fog disappeared. Mara shot down wind and created a breeze which dispersed the cloud. Mara shot wrong views and created darkness which enveloped the world. The Bodhisattva shot right views and created a sun which illuminated the world. The Bodhisattva adorned the arrows of patience and put the roots of discipline firm onto the earth, he adorned himself with the jewels of energy and meditation and took the bosom “compassion” and the arrow “brilliant state” from the quiver “cold” and he attained victory. The gods of the pure abodes advised Mara to desist. It might be possible, they said, to deprive all beings of their own nature, but not to hinder the Bodhisattva’s course. The account ends with the ceiling of the earth as witness to the Bodhisattva’s good deeds and the final defeat of Mara.

The last group consists of the Latoavítsara (EV) Chapter XXI, T 196 Fa-pan-hsing-hi-chung, which has been translated by S. Beal under the title The Romantic History of Sakyam Bod- blo and T 186 Fu-yeo-ching. Beal began to translate the latter text too, but he found the text so corrupt and imperfect and the style of the composition so inflated that he gave up the task.27) The episode of the Buddha’s temptation according to these three texts is as follows: T 186, L, and T 195 say that the Bodhisattva sent a ray into Mara’s palace and that Mara had 32 dreams foreboding evil. He called his adherents together and told them of his dreams, and of a voice he had heard telling him of the Bodhisattva who would obtain enlightenment. A sen called Shrestha in T 190 and Sarthartha in L and T 186 required why his father looked so pale and worried and he advised him not to fight. T 190 relates that the Bodhisattva approached an Amra tree. The gods, wishing to indicate the proper Bodhítree, hung garlands on it. A Yaksha deputed another Yaksha, Red-eyes, to war. Mara ordered the Yaksha to hinder the Bodhi-
satta going to the right tree. The Yaksas and the guardian spirit of the wood praised the Bodhisatta. Mara approached the Bodhitree and asked the Bodhisattva to go to some other place, which the Bodhisattva refused to do. Mara took the shape of a messenger bringing from Kapilavastu, informing the Bodhisattva that Devadatta had usurped the government and invited onceuddhodana. The Bodhisattva remained firm and the tree spirits restrained him. LV, T 186 and T 190 continue by relating the conversation between Mara, his minister and his sons, 200 of whom took sides with the Bodhisattva, dissuading their father from attacking, while 200 others urged him on. In the following passage, the three accounts again diverge. T 186 says that Mara sent his four daughters to seduce the Bodhisattva, while T 190 mentions Mara's female attendants, who were departed by Mara to this end, and later he sent his three daughters. LV mentions daughters of Mara without giving their number. 28 On their father's instigation, they attempted to seduce the Bodhisattva, and their father scolded them for being unable to do so. According to T 190, when the women saw that the Bodhisattva was not to be moved, they went away hoping him success, while according to T 186 they are turned into old women. The account continues by Mara asking the Bodhisattva once more to leave the Bodhitree and enjoy life and when Mara saw this did not impress the Bodhisattva, he told him he would be able to prevent a terrible war by righteous government. Mara then rushed at the Bodhisattva with his army of demons. The weapons that were thrown turned into flowers. Mara's son Shreshthi begged his father to desist, and so did a god of the pure abodes. The gods assisted the Bodhisattva, who emerged victorious from the battle and gained supreme enlightenment. LV too has a long—description of Mara's army followed by discussions between Mara's sons and finally Mara's attack. Mara fought with ten different means, wind, rain, stones, weapons, coal, ash, sand, mud and darkness. Mara, sitting on his elephant Shriyuktha 29 fled, returned again and hurled his disc at the Bodhisattva, but he was finally defeated, all his weapons having turned into flowers.

LV then mentions eight spirits, while T 186 refers to the spirits without giving their number. They uttered sixteen benedictions, and the gods of the pure abodes uttered sixteen curses against Mara in LV, eighteen in T 186. The spirits of the Bodhitree also cursed Mara in sixteen manners. In both accounts, LV and T 186 a conversation between the Bodhisattva and Mara follows. A number of these verses agree literally. T 188 ends with verses already found in T 184 and T 185.

As can be seen from the above summary of some version of the temptation of the Bodhisattva, there are many different accounts of the same episode. The versions differ from each another in important respects.
The way in which Menæ tried to induce the Buddha to see the attitude of the gods so as above, or in details, none of which are listed below,

1. a) the temptation takes place to force the enlightenment: T 184, 185, 186, 190, LV, 191, 193, Be, T 1450
b) after the enlightenment
SN, MS, T 199, 190

2. a) The Buddha tells the Mara to fire
T 184, 185, 190, LV, T 186
b) Mara is warned by two brahmas
T 191, 1950
c) not menaced
Be, Sn, RS
d) Mara is warned by an earthquake
T 180, 193
e) Menæ has 37 dreams foreboding evil
T 180, LV, T 190

3. a) Menæ's family
b) not mentioned
Sn
b) three daughters
MS, T 99, 100, 184, 185 (compared by two attendants)
189, 190 (note of the three attendants), 191, Be, T 1416
LV (three daughters are mentioned in a second temptation after the enlightenment)
c) Four daughters
T 186
d) One son
T 184, 185, 189
c) three sons
Be
d) thousand sons
T 190, LV, T 186
1) two sisters
Be, T 189

4. a) Menæ's daughters go to the Buddha in their own accord
MS, T 99, 100, 192, 185
b) they are seen by their father
T 186, LV, RS of his go with him
T 189, Be, T 193
c) they are turned into old women
T 184, 185, 186, 189, 191, 193, 1450

14
5. Men's proposals
   a) He should enjoy life.
      T 197, 199
   b) He should perform sacrifices.
      T 193, 197
   c) He should live like a kshatriya.
      Rc, T 189, 193, 197
   d) He should return to Kapilavastu.
      T 197, 199
   e) He should rule in Men's world.
      T 189
   f) He should prevent a terrible war.
      T 199
   g) He should join men, but should not preach.
      T 99, 105, H3

6. The earthly life and the Buddha's matrix.
   T 189, 193, LV

NOTES
2. See below, p. 11.
3. See below, p. 18 for a detailed list.
4. ed. Rusch, p. 70.
5. T 197, p. 77 b.
8. Windisch, F., Men and Buddhism, Leipzig 1905.
12. Stenfin, p. 76.
13. Winnefeld, E., Men and Buddhists, p. 125.
14. This title is also found in Majjhima Nigri, I, 234.
16. J. de J. H. H. Egbertson, F., Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Dictionary, New Haven, 1953 s.v. ogha referring to the Suttapana 13:3: it is not clear what is meant by the five and six streams. From the Chinese it might seem that the five streams are connected with the five senses, the sixth with mind.

17. According to T 191 he brought letters from Buddhodana, according to T 145 he came running with a verbal message.

18. In T 191 the Bodhisattva seems to refer to Mara as brahma, p. 930 b line 6.

19. The tallovarana, Chapter XXII, ed. P. L. Vaidya, Dhublinga 1928 p. 433 (511: 448) states that the Buddha rose in the air to the height of seven palm trees, as the gods expected him to make a sign after the enlightenment. No reason is given in our texts.

20. Roehrs, Le Canon Bouddhique en Chine, p. 369


22. In Majjhiya Nikaya I, 333 a Mara of a previous age, who is Meghavatta in this age is mentioned. He had a sister, Kali, whose son in the Mara of the present age.

23. Buddhadeva, XIII, 7

24. Buddhadeva, XIII, 31

25. The ten powers are: 1) sahasrathana-janamahala, 2) karmaskara-janamahala, 3) dhyānadekkhamahalājanamahala, 4) indriyaparipranisajjanamahala, 5) nandaka-sukhajanamahala, 6) nandaka-sayanamahala, 7) ugrārajajangrangi-janamahala, 8) sarvastamani-janamahala, 9) gopavagyajjanamahala, 10) sarvastamani-janamahala. See Waldschmidt, E., Ein zweiter Durchschnitt, Mitteilungen des Institutes für Orientforschung, Band VI, Heft 1, 1938, p. 358.

26. It is not clear what these five purities are.

27. Sacred Books of the East, Vol. XIX, p. IX.

28. In Lalitavistara, Chapter XXIV, three daughters of Mara are mentioned who approached the Buddha after the enlightenment.

29. An elephant Girivakula is mentioned in the Nidana-sutta, p. 73

16
Abbreviations

(Please refer to bibliography)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bc</td>
<td>Buddhacarita</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LV</td>
<td>Lattitvanav</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MS</td>
<td>Marasanyuta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SBE</td>
<td>Sacred Books of the East</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sn</td>
<td>Suttapitaka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SN</td>
<td>Sanyutta Nikaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T</td>
<td>Tatobo Datamyo, Tokyo 1927—33</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Books Consulted:

Pali and Sanskrit Texts
Morasamutta, Sakyata Nibbaya, ed. PTS
Padhanayana, Suttanipata, PTS
Niddanakotha, Jatake Vol. 1
Majjhima Nibbaya
The Buddhacarita, ed. E.S. Johnston, Delhi 1977
Lalitavistara, ed. P.N. Vaidhya, Buddhist Sanskrit Texts No. 1
Durbarings 1958

Chinese Texts

T 99 Tsu-a-lun, the complete Sanyuktagama
T 100 P'ie-yi Tsu-a-lun, an incomplete Sanyuktagama
T 184 Hsin-hsing-yun-ch'ing translated 157 A.D. by Chou Ta-li and Kang Meng-hsing
T 185 Fu-shou-ch'ing-translated 149 A.D. by Chih'en between 222 and 280 A.D.
T 186 Pu-yun-ching translated 368 A.D. by Dharmaraksa
T 190 Ku-chu-t'ai-yin-in-kao-ch'ing (Adhutaprayamana-tantra) translated by Guan-hsi, dated between 430 and 479 A.D.
T 190 Fu-pen-hsing-ch'ing (Athaatinirucchitta) translated by Jian-guota - Romatic History of Sakyamuni Buddha, translated by S. Beal
T 191 Fu-shou-chang-hua-hai-ti-chuang translated by Fu-hien in the 5th century
T 193 To-pen-hsing-ching (Abhidharmavacana-sutra) translated by Pu-yun 477-489 A.D.
T 1950 Ken-pen-shou-i-ch'el-yung's nai-yeh Vinaya of the Mulasarvastivadins
T. 2034 Li Tai sun pao chi by Fei Chang-shing-feng 597 A.D.


Rea, S., The Religious History of Savina Buddha from the Chinese-Sanskrit, London 1875

Charpentier, J., Des Maravagamaya au Mahavacta, Wiener Zeitschrift für die Kunde des Morgenländes, XXIII, 1909

Edgerton, E., Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Grammar and Dictionary, William Dwight Whitney Linguistic Series, New Haven 1959


The Buddhist Conception of Mara in: Buddhistic Studies, ed. B.C. Law, Calcuta 1932

Mallecker, G.P., A Dictionary of Lali Proper Names, London 1960

Nanjio, H., A Catalogue of the Chinese Translations of the Buddhist Tripitaka, Oxford 1883

Olenburg, H., Der Satzak des Buddhismus, Deutsche Rundschau, 1886

Przybyski, J., La place de Mara dans la mythologie bouddhique, Journal Asiatique, CCX, 1927


Waldschmidt, E., 'Die Legende von Leben des Buddha in Auszügen aus den Heiligen Texten, Berlin 1917

Ein zweites Danzebolenatva, Mitteilungen des Institutes für Orientforschung, VI, 3, 1958

Windsich, E., Mara und Buddha, Leipzig 1895
P. Banerjee
Assistant Director, National Museum, New Delhi.

THE STORY OF RUPIANANDA FROM BAMIYAN, AFGHANISTAN

As is well known, Afghanistan was an important centre of Buddhism and Buddhist art during the early centuries of the Christian era. Begram, Hadda, Bamiyan and several other sites have provided abundant material for the study of Buddhist religion and art from the Kushan times to C. seventh-eighth century. Of all the sites, Bamiyan offers the highest attraction. While the other Buddhist remains have very much crumbled and fallen into ruins, the rock-cut caves of Bamiyan have still retained in spite of long neglect, visibilities and human valourisms pinch of its old grandeur in the form of many interesting paintings and sculptures.

Bamiyan, being on the old silk route, was a meeting place of many peoples and cultures, and as such Bamiyan art shows a conglomeration of traditions, Indian, Sassanian and Chinese with the native or local styles.

The object of this paper is to offer a new interpretation or identification of a wall painting (PL.1) from Bamiyan, (occurring on the niche of the 55m. Buddha) which has been described by Benjamin Rowland as Bodhisattva Maitreya and his Sakti.

The main or central figure is seated on an elaborate throne inside a shrine with a domed top. His legs are crossed at the ankles (and not shown interlocked in yoga), while the hands are in vitarkamudra (the gesture of discussion or teaching). Except for a narrow scarf, he is nude from the waist, though for his lower garments he has an elaborate dhoti reaching his ankles. He seems, however, to be endowed with a necklace and bracelets.

Beside this main figure, stands a female figure beneath a tree. Both these figures show great charm and grace, typical of the classical Gupta style. In describing the beauty of the female figure, Rowland says, "...she evokes her provocative charm, beside the throne of the great soft-bodied Bodhisattva; entirely nude she bends graciously forward, stretching forth her slender-like hand from beneath a tree that twists and whirls in a curiously twisting way, the contours of the trunk and the finger like branches suggesting the insinuating curves of the lady in its shade."
Rowland identifies the main figure as Bodhisattva Maitreya on the basis of the similarity of the sitting posture and hand gesture of the present figure with those of the countless Bodhisattvas (specially labelled as Bodhisattva Maitreya) in the cave-temples at Lungmen in China. Further, Rowland seems to have been led to this belief by his supposition that over the throne, there is a soma, an attribute associated with the Eucere Buddha (Maitreya) and not employed for the Bodhisattvas. Regarding the female figure Rowland does not explain his reasons for describing her as 'the Sakti of Maitreya'.

Rowland's identification, which he calls, however, of a probable nature does not seem to be supported by facts. The main figure here is seated on a throne inside a shrine with a domed top. There is no soma over the throne, as supposed by him. Further, this figure does not hold any other known attribute of Maitreya, such as a nectar vase or a Nagakeara flower. The gandhara or Kushan sculptures of Maitreya are found to hold a nectar jug, one of his distinguishing characteristics, which is missing in the present case.

As is being explained below, the present painting seems to illustrate the story of Buddha's teaching to Rupananda or Janapadakalyani on the impermanence of form of beauty. at Jetavana, the grove which was presented by prince Jeta in Bravari for the use of Buddha and his community.

The story which occurs in the Dhammapada-sathakatha 4 tells us that Janapadakalyani possessed great charm and she was very much conscious of it. Pating that her brother (Buddha himself), her husband (Nanda) and other kinsfolk have become monks and her mother has also become a nun, she joined the Buddhist community as a nun. This was, however, not out of her faith in the doctrine but of her love of the kinsfolk. Because she possessed great beauty, she came to be called Rupananda.

One day Buddha said, "'Beauty of form is impermanent, involved in suffering, unreal, so likewise are sensation, perception, the aggregate of mental states, consciousness impermanent, involved in suffering.'" 5 This put Rupananda to think that if she met Buddha face to face, he would find fault with her beauty. Therefore, she avoided seeing the Master face to face.

Once having heard the nuns praise her brother, i.e. the Buddha, in extravagant phrases, she (Rupananda) made up her mind to go with the other nuns to listen to his instructions without letting herself being seen by Buddha.

22
Buddha, however, came to know through his spiritual vision that Rupananda would come to pay respects to him and thought that it would be good to her if he curbed her pride in her beauty.

When Rupananda came and sat behind the nuns, Buddha created a phantom of a young woman as beautiful as the full moon. Seeing this, Rupananda considered her own beauty as of no consequence. Buddha then transformed the woman into a middle-aged person and through stages ultimately to an old, decrepit woman who had enough sufferings and died in misery. Rupananda's heart became filled with disgust and she could realise the impermanence of her own beauty and 'her mind sprang forth to meditation.'

Buddha said to her, 'Nanu, think not, there is reality in this body...
It is a city of bones, plastered with flesh and blood, whose fudge old age and death and pride and deceit."

The present painting does not depict all the details of the story. We do not find in the picture the phantom of any beautiful woman Buddha created to curb the pride of Rupananda, nor do we find here the nuns behind whom, Rupananda took her seat in the congregation. Art is suggestive and it is an accepted fact that the artist need not follow in his work all the details of a story. In conformity to this, the artist of Rupananda seems to have been selective. To make the point clear the text in Stavastī, where the Buddha preached the law of impermanence of beauty to Rupananda is suggested by a tree beneath which Rupananda (whom Rowland describes as Bodhisattva Maitrey's Sakti without sufficient reason) stands. That the female figure probably represents Rupananda is, can be inferred also from the exquisite beauty invested in it by the artist.

Further, the story that Rupananda, who was conscious of her beauty and avoided the Master seeing face to face has been very skillfully depicted, by the artist as he has shown her not in front of Buddha but by his side beneath a tree.

Again, there is hardly any doubt that the main figure is of Buddha, with elongated ears and short hair characteristic of Buddha figures. The only deviations seem to be the ornament on his body. But it is well known that the concept of ornamented and bejewelled Buddha, many examples of which we find in the early medieval period, were perhaps taken from now, i.e., a seventh century to which the present painting can be attributed on stylistic grounds.

From the proceeding, it is clear that there is no plausibility in Rowland's suggested identification of the present scene as one of Maitreya and
his Sakti on the other hand, when one considers the details of this painting against the background of the Rupananda story, one feels inclined to hold that the scene depicts Buddha's instructions to Rupananda on the impermanence of the beauty of form.

Though Mahayana Buddhism with Tantrik elements including the worship of female principles developed in different parts of India and Afghanistan, since Asanga's time, i.e., 2nd-3rd century A.D., still Hinayana Buddhism held its sway for a considerable time. The art of Ajanta Bamiyan and of Central Asia till the seventh-eighth century was predominantly of Hinayana inspiration. Hence, there is nothing surprising in finding Hinayana scenes depicted in Bamiyan as late as the sixteenth-seventeenth century. That Bamiyan was an important stronghold of Hinayana Buddhism during the period in question is evident also from the account of the Chinese pilgrim Huen Tsang.

Before we conclude, it may be mentioned that not many representations of the Rupananda story are found. In addition to the present one, there is a fragmentary Amaravati sculpture showing this story as identified by Sivaramamurti.

---

**FOOT NOTES**


A TRANSLATION OF THE BIOGRAPHY OF THE MAHASIDDHA INDRABHUTI
WITH NOTES.
Nathan Katz

THE LIFE OF GURJ. I. NDRA. BHUTI

1. As for the account of Guru Indrabhuti:
2. In the country of U.γγαν., there were five hundred thousand
   cities.
3. Two kings ruled them.
4. Indrabhuti ruled the two hundred fifty thousand cities of Samdhola.
5. At the same time, King La.λa. ndra ruled the two hundred fifty
   thousand cities of La.nγka.bu.νi.
6. To the king of Samdhola, Indrabhuti, there was a sister, La.λakshmi-
   ka.νa. s-called, who was seven years old.
7. (La.λakshmi ka.νa) was given to the son of the king of Langkaburi,
   Jalandra, because of the asking (for her hand).
8. King Indrabhuti gathered all of his ministers, and while they were
   advising (him) (they said):
9. "Jalandra does not practice Dharma. Except for that, all other
   things are equal," and, so saying, it was promised to give (La.λakshmi-
   ka.νa).
10. To a messenger they said: "There is a difference between one
    who practices Dharma and one who does not practice Dharma.
    (Nevertheless) we will join families." And they sent him back.
11. After that, in the following year, the son (of Jalandra) came to
    Samdhola.
12. He met with La.λakshmi ka.νa, and then departed to his own country.
13. Indrabhuti bestowed and sent many presents of gold, silver, horses,
    cows, and the like.
14. He (the prince) set out towards his own country, and his father
    said: "Where is your wife?"
15. "Because the daughter was young, they wouldn't let her go,"
    he said.
16. (The father) said: "That's proper!"
17. At that time, Indrabhuti had many wives.
18. Because they all had nothing but drift in the Dharma, the nobility,
    together with the queens, after requesting from Lama Vb.λa.λa.γa.
initiation and spiritual instruction, were striving for attainment.

19. When the lady had attained the age of sixteen years, Jalanda sent a message about the method of giving the lady into marriage.

20. Since the lady's mind was depressed towards the world, (she) did her siddhi.

21. While attaining the siddhi of 'earth-discovering', (she) welcomed sweepers and the like.

22. Those who had gone to heaven are made clear in the lady's own biography.

23. After that, King Jalanda gave a message to King Indrabhuti with news about the way the lady was doing: "The 'earth-discovering' which has thought about the generation of the lady is proper. (But) making oneself peaceful and blissful is not proper," he said.

24. After that, Indrabhuti's thought: "The uselessness of my sister's being born is piling up. To the fact that I am of little benefit to the kingdom, there is great retribution. It is necessary that I give it up and practice Dharma," he thought.

25. He entrusted the kingdom to his own son and made him attain a good house.

26. After twelve years, he attained to Mahamudra.

27. Since the retinue didn't know (about this), the son and the retinue of subjects set out to see (him).

28. They commenced to open the door of that one (house). From the sky, (they heard):

29. "Do not open the door. I am here," he (Indrabhuti) said.

30. Hearing this, (they) looked to the sky and they saw that he was dwelling (there).

31. Then there was born the joy of having attained as much as the first bhumi.

32. Saluting according to their faith, they sat down to one side.

33. Having stayed in the sky for seven days, the royal father, the son and the retinue of subjects, said:

34. "Thought cannot penetrate the depth and expanse of the Dharma."

35. Together with the etime of seven hundred people, he went to heaven with this very body.

36. The account of Gou Indrabhuti is complete.

26
NOTES ON THE TRANSLATION

2. Jurgutan: Skt. Udayana. Presently Swat State in the Paki-
tani Himalayas; also the home of Gesu Rinpoche.

4. Samabhala: Spelling resembles Shambhala, a mythic Tibetan
paradise-realm. Although Samabhala is usually said to be in the
north, Samabhala is to the west.

9. "does not practice Dharma": is not a Buddhist.

13. Indrabhuti sends gifts as dowry. It is customary in many Eastern
countries to have a two-stage marriage: a betrothal, at which time
dowries are paid and the union is often consummated; and a
wedding held some time later.

18. "nothing but faith in the Dharma": This implies faith as opposed
to experience and direct knowledge. Because of this lack, the
wives are seeking the teachings.

18. Lama Weyla: Literally, the one with a goitre.

19. We assume that the wedding took place at this time. This would
account for Lakshminara's depressed state as described in line
twenty.

20. "mind was depressed toward the world": Tib. yid. byud.
This may also be translated as "to renounce".

21. "earth-discovering" Siddhi: We do not know just what this
Siddhi is. However the image of getting in touch with the basic
fact of the world is carried through in her acquaintance with the
sweepers, who occupy a very low caste position.

22. This topic is discussed in the biography of Lakshminara, who is
also one of the 84 Mahasiddhas. This story now returns to
Indrabhuti.

23. Probably Lakshminara is upset with Lakshminara's orthodox behavior,
although he does respect her spiritual accomplishments. In his
Hindu kingdom, the idea of a princess (of kshatriya caste) associating
with sweepers is quite outrageous.

24. This is the turning-point of Indrabhuti's life, and is a common
motif in the lives of the Mahasiddhas. We find similar inspira-
tions in the lives of Tilopa, Naropa, and others.

25. "attain a good house": Probably an idiom referring to
Indrabhuti's getting the afflatus of state in order for the
transference of power to his son.

27
31. "the first bhumi": Tib. sa dung po.

32. "sat down to one side": A way of showing respect to an exalted person.

35. "went to heaven in this very body": This refers either to immortality or, more likely, to the siddhi of skywalking, which is spontaneously attained in many of these biographies. (Miroslav Eliade, in his studies on Shamanism, concludes that references to flying are a way of speaking about ecstasy).
THE NAMGYAL INSTITUTE OF TIBETOLOGY

A short note on the Namgyal Institute of Tibetology has appeared in the Bulletin of Tibetology, Vol X, No. 1. In this note attempt is made to complete or update the information.

The Namgyal Institute of Tibetology is a unique contribution to the cause of learning. The word Tibetology means the study of the Chhos (Dharma) and the culture and art and sciences associated with Chhos. Chhos has been the energising force in the spiritual, social and cultural life of the people living in the vast mass of land forming the southern slopes of the Himalaya to the northern slopes of the Altai Karakoram and even beyond.

The Foundation Stone of the Institute was laid by His Holiness the Dalai Lama on the 10th February 1957 and the Institute was declared open by the late Prime Minister of India Mr Jwala Pratap Narain on the 1st October, 1958. According to the Charter of Incorporation dated 28th October, 1959 granted by the Chogyal XI, the Institute enjoys the status of an autonomous body with a Governing Council to administer it. It is financed by the Government of Sikkim and the Government of India on a matching basis. The present Chogyal has been the President of the Governing Council from its inception and as a result of his leadership and interest the Institute has grown to its present stage. It has now been listed in International publication like the "World of Learning", the "International Universities Bureau", and the "Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development".

The building of the Institute is one of the most imposing Monuments in Sikkim. It is a splendid example of Sikkimese architecture by virtue of its pagoda-like tin roofs, painted turquoise. The building was incomplete in so far as the two rear towers consisting of six rooms had yet to be completed. The work of completion of the two rear towers was undertaken in 1971 and completed in the latter half of 1977 and thus has provided much needed space. Further, more staff quarters have been constructed during 1974 on the premises especially for the lower paid staff.

Security arrangements have also been installed in the building to prevent fire and theft.

The Chogyal has empowered the Institute to cover the study of the doctrines of all associated Sects and Schools of Mahayana Buddhism. Consequentially under the powers of the Charter the Institute has been
collecting books of all the Sects and has a representative collection of over 30,000 books and treatises in Nyingmapa, Kargyupa, Sakya and Gelugpa works. Further some rare Lepcha Manuscripts have been added to the collection. During 1977-78 the Institute acquired manuscripts and xylographs totalling 354 from Mr G. Tharchin and also established a programme of lectures. In 1974 the Institute purchased a total of 157 Tibetan books consisting of 36 xylographs, 16 manuscripts and 65 printed books apart from 109 books for the General library. Thus this institute is a unique public establishment in the Government of Sikkim anywhere in the Tibetan speaking countries where books of different Sects are being stored and preserved in one repository. As such the Institute may be destined to serve the interests of Chho in a more lasting manner than perhaps any establishment anywhere in the Mahayana world.

Over the years the technical and administrative full-time staff of the Institute has grown from 3 in 1959 to 17 in 1977 and 19 at present. Furthermore, the present technical strength is 10 as against 5 in 1971 and 7 in 1973. In addition three learned Lamas, Doelpa Chen Rinpoche, Lhakpa Zangpo and Ngawang Rinpoche are attached to the Institute to advise and act as consultants.

Apart from providing research facilities to scholars interested in the study of Chho, the learned Lamas and scholars are engaged in research activities, imparting instruction in the Holy Dharma and the teaching of Tibetan language.

The Institute brings out regular publications of its Bulletin of Tibetology. Articles from learned scholars on religion and philosophy figure conspicuously in the issues of the Bulletin. So also there are contributions on linguistics and philosophy, history and social institutions of Tibet and epigraphy and geography. In addition to the Bulletin of Tibetology, some of the other important publications are:

(i) Vinmati Vijnaptimatratad-Sadhā
(ii) Socha Gyalpo Korzed
(iii) Melong Dpal-chen-yan-can-rgyig-gyi-tsho Nying-po
(iv) Rgyan-Drug Mchog-Gnyis (reprinted 1970)

The Institute has a programme of initiating study along a few lines viz (a) Tibetan Medicine, (b) Translation of Tibetan works, (c) Collection of Tibetan works and (d) Tibetan Art.

Apart from these important developments, the Institute awards scholarships to young scholars for full time research work, has initiated a project for the establishment of a Museum and introduced a guide-
system. The Museum Project is nearing completion and during the year the Institute undertook a programme to reproduce xylograph books of important works from blocks preserved at the Institute and from individuals. These are sold at the counter almost at cost price for the benefit of devotees and others interested.

To help facilitate study, there is a Hostel attached to the Institute where genuine scholars can stay at a small charge.

A. M. D'ROZARIO.
Price Rupees Six

The Institute is an autonomous organisation administered by a
Governing Body.

President of the Governing Body—The Chogyal of Sikkim
Director—A.M. D’Rosario, Ph.D. (Cantab), Dip. Ed (Cantab)
Assistant Director—Mr Tashi Densapa, M.A. (USA)—on leave
Acting Assistant Director—Rectang Rinpoche—Called for
Geshti Lhosampa (Tibet)

Ven. Dodrup Chen Rinpoche—Learned Lama
Khenpo Lhodo Zango—Learned Lama
Ngawang Rinpoche—Learned Lama
Kunga Yonten Hochotsang—Research Officer
Tsagong T. Bhutia—Microfilm Assistant
Jompaysho Lamo—Research Assistant
Kalang Lamo—Tibetan Librarian
Sherab Ralshi—Assistant
Karma Lhadup—Assistant.